



**(§68) ECRI recommends that the authorities enhance the capacity of law enforcement agencies in effectively identifying and addressing racist and LGBTIphobic hate speech and hate crime by providing more targeted and practical training on the 2019 Hate Crime Protocol.**

As it was pointed out in ECRI's report on Hungary (adopted on 6 December 2022), the Hate Crime Protocol which entered into force in August 2019, is binding on all police forces. The Protocol incorporates a list of bias indicators to facilitate the identification of hate crimes and expands the institutional framework of the Hate Crime Special Network (set up in 2012) by requiring the appointment of 'mentors' at every local police unit. The Protocol also foresees the organization of training for police staff on a regular basis.

The adoption of the Hate Crime Protocol was initiated by the Hungarian Working Group Against Hate Crimes. The Working Group has repeatedly pointed out that the implementation of the Protocol and the work of the Hate Crime Special Network would only be effective if certain conditions – amongst those the effective and regular training that enables police patrols to get acquainted with the Protocol to the extent that it becomes part of their routine to take into account bias indicators whenever necessary – were met.

In its 2022 report, ECRI considers that training for police officers on the 2019 Hate Crime Protocol needs to be significantly improved and that more should be done to ensure that the Protocol is part of the daily police practice. Therefore, ECRI recommends, as a matter of priority, that the authorities enhance the capacity of law enforcement agencies in effectively identifying and addressing racist and LGBTI-phobic hate speech and hate crime by providing more targeted and practical training on the 2019 Hate Crime Protocol.

We requested information from the relevant authorities on the hate crime related training of the police, prosecutors and judges.

## Police

It is clear from the data received in April 2024 that in 2022-2023 – similarly to the previous years – police personnel mainly attended training sessions organized by the police themselves. Although the Hate Crime Protocol prescribes annual training on bias indicators and the characteristics of hate crimes, such training sessions were not included in the annual training programs for any counties in 2022, and only for two counties – Heves and Tolna – in 2023. For these 2 years, the police reported the implementation of altogether 88 training sessions that touched upon the topic of hate crimes, although some of these had a much broader focus (such as dealing with the cooperation between the police and the Roma community or with access to justice of vulnerable populations). The list includes local trainings on bias indicators in 8 counties (Bács-Kiskun, Békés, Borsod-Abaúj-Zemplén, Csongrád-Csanád, Hajdú-Bihar, Jász-Nagykun-Szolnok, Nógrád and Tolna).



The National Police Headquarters conducted a one-day training for mentors and area specialist officers (altogether 176 persons) on 26 May 2022 on handling hate crimes. In our view, the fact that this training was only one day and these training sessions are not of a regular nature reinforces the concern that responsible police officers do not have the necessary knowledge and skills to tackle bias motivated crimes appropriately, furthermore, it underlines that this is not a priority task at all.

The training on "Anti-Semitism and Hate Crimes" was carried out for all the staff concerned between 1 March 2022 and 31 December 2022, however, this was only a 30-minute training course.

Beyond the above, between 1 January 2022 and 31 December 2023, about 1200 persons were trained at several police-organized vocational workshops on hate crimes (or related to hate crimes in a wider context). The duration of these workshops varied from only 20 minutes to 6 hours. However, only 476 persons participated in a workshop that was longer than one hour.

There were a few not-police-organized training events in the past two years.

There was one e-learning course co-developed by our member organization, Háttér Society, and the Deputy Ombudsman for National Minority Rights called „Counter hate – Helping victims of hate crime through a victim-centered and intersectional approach.” 12 members of the police participated in this training.

In the years 2022-23, there were two conferences co-hosted by the Deputy Ombudsman for National Minority Rights and the Res Iudicata Association of Judges for Social Awareness (co-hosting as speakers also the members of our Working Group), one of them especially focused on the topic of hate speech, where 13 members of the police participated in person or online.

With the exception of the above 3 trainings/conferences, in spite of the fact that the National Police Headquarters' Instruction on Police Tasks Related to the Handling of Hate Crime Police (that also contains the Protocol) prescribes active cooperation between the police and NGO experts, we were not invited to any of the police organized training courses (or any other events) aiming to help police personnel detect and investigate hate crimes more efficiently. We finally have to note that regarding the cooperation between the Working Group and the police, consulting with us is much more the exception than the norm and these occasions are not an integral part of police operation. In fact, we see a lowering level of willingness on the part of the police to consult with us throughout the past years.

## Prosecutors

As to the specialized training of prosecutors, the answer of the office of the Prosecutor General pointed out that „prosecutors regularly receive training on hate crimes at training courses organized by the Personnel and Training Department of the Prosecutor General's Office and the Hungarian Prosecutors' Training Centre. The presentations of the training courses, meetings



and conferences are made available to all staff in electronic form on the Prosecution Intranet. However, special courses on this topic are currently not included in the annual training plan, which includes some 28-30 different training courses, but as part of the annual training courses, those most involved in combating hate crime receive lectures and case law from prosecution experts, information on the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, on the work of the Working Group on Hate Crime, and on the 2019 Hate Crime Protocol.”

The Hungarian Prosecutor Training Centre regularly holds training courses for prosecutors on effective action against hate crime, the latest decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and the activities of the Working Group against Hate Crime.

As part of the compulsory training of trainee prosecutors 52 persons participated in a 90-minute lecture entitled “Crimes against human freedom, dignity and fundamental rights” held on January 19, 2022.

A 60-minute lecture was given by the Assistant Prosecutor General of Győr, an expert on the subject, entitled “Effective response to hate crimes, decisions by the European Court of Human Rights, the activities of the Working Group Against Hate Crimes, and the 2019 prosecutorial circular” was delivered on February 17, 2022 and February 16, 2023 for junior prosecutors with the participation of 40 persons each.

A 45-minute lecture entitled “On hate crimes” was given to about 100 people on 4 May 2022, and to 108 people on 16 January 2023 at the training of young prosecutors appointed not more than 3 years ago.

On October 13, 2022 and October 9, 2023, 60-90-minute lectures were held on hate crimes and respectful treatment of victims for the 33 deputy chief prosecutors responsible for criminal investigations.

In the annual scientific conference of the Prosecution Service presentations related to hate crimes were delivered on November 21, 2022 and November 23, 2023 focusing on proving hate crimes and antifa hate crimes respectively.

However, no external actors were involved into the relevant training of the prosecutors, nor was our Working Group invited to train or consult them.

## Judges

According to the answer we received from the National Court Office, in November 2023, the Hungarian Academy of Justice organized four 60-minute online training sessions on hate crimes for judges, reaching a total of 170 participants (including 62 judges, 78 court secretaries, and 30 law clerks). The topics of the training were: the background of hate crime and the proceedings at the ECtHR; hate crime investigations; lessons learned from hate crime prosecutions; substantive and evidence-related aspects of hate crime.



WORKING GROUP AGAINST  
HATE CRIMES IN HUNGARY

Furthermore, 24 judges, 14 court secretaries and 2 law clerks participated in trainings focusing on human rights, anti-semitism and victims' rights organized in the framework of the European Judicial Training Network. The human rights training included 105 minutes of training on hate crimes, two webinars in March 2022 and April 2023, and two two-day training sessions on anti-semitism and victims' rights in April 2022 and 2023 were fully devoted to the topic.

NGO members of the Working Group Against Hate Crimes were not invited to most of the training sessions and conferences (except for one training organized by Háttér, and two conferences co-organized by the Deputy Ombudsman for National Minority Rights and Res Iudicata, an association of judges), so the content and quality of these training programs are difficult to assess.